

**TABLE 1 – COMPARISON OF ALTERNATIVES**

Alternatives	Advantages	Disadvantages	Issues	Costs <sup>(1)</sup>
<b>1 Disconnect Customers 2 MGD</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Eliminates costs for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Dams</li> <li>Diversion pipelines</li> <li>Layng Creek Site</li> <li>Transmission main</li> </ul> </li> <li>Eliminates remote sites.</li> <li>Eliminates existing filters</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No service to extraterritorial customers.</li> <li>Loss of revenue.</li> <li>Requires early expansion of R.R. Plant.</li> <li>Requires demolition of dams, Layng Cr. Plant and suspension bridge.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Can City stop serving existing customers?</li> <li>Is City willing to stop serving existing customers?</li> <li>What level of demolition will be required?</li> <li>Who will own the abandoned sites?</li> <li>What is the cost for expansion of the R.R. Plant?</li> </ol>	\$10,642
<b>2 Pump From Row River 2 MGD</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continues service to all customers.</li> <li>Eliminates costs for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Dams</li> <li>Diversion pipelines</li> <li>Treatment plant, both sites.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Eliminates remote facility.</li> <li>Eliminates facilities at Layng Creek sites.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Requires improvements to transmission main.</li> <li>Requires new pump station.</li> <li>Requires new storage reservoir.</li> <li>Requires demolition of dams, Layng Creek Plant, and the suspension bridge.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>What level of demolition will be required?</li> <li>Who will own the abandoned sites?</li> <li>Where should pump station and reservoir be constructed?</li> <li>What is the cost for the R.R. Plant expansion?</li> <li>What is the cost of transmission main repairs?</li> <li>There may be a concern of stale water in the trans. main.</li> </ol>	\$15,500
<b>3 Slow Sand Filters 2 MGD</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continues service to all customers.</li> <li>Continues to use facilities at Layng Creek Plant.</li> <li>Provides a new plant adaptable to automation.</li> <li>Minimizes costs for new treatment facilities.</li> <li>Defers expansion of R.R. Plant.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continues remote facilities.</li> <li>Improvements are required for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Dams</li> <li>Diversion pipeline</li> <li>Treatment plant @ lower site.</li> <li>Transmission main.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Requires new storage reservoir.</li> <li>Requires additional land @ lower site.</li> <li>Requires continued maintenance of upper site.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Land acquisition.</li> <li>Costs for probable fish passage requirements.</li> <li>Continued remote operations.</li> <li>Long term costs associated with remote operations.</li> <li>Requires occasional "emergency visit".</li> </ol>	\$14,162
<b>4 Package Plant 2 MGD</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continues service to all customers.</li> <li>Combines treatment operations into one site.</li> <li>Provides new plant adaptable to automation.</li> <li>Defers expansion of R.R. Plant.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continues remote operations.</li> <li>Requires improvements to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Dams</li> <li>Diversion pipeline</li> <li>Treatment plant @ lower site.</li> <li>Transmission main.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Requires new storage reservoir.</li> <li>Requires demolition of upper site.</li> <li>Requires additional land @ lower site.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continued remote operation</li> <li>Requirement for occasional "emergency visit"</li> <li>Fish passage.</li> <li>Land acquisition.</li> </ol>	\$\$14,858
<b>5 Cartridge Filters 2 MGD</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continues service to all customers.</li> <li>Combines treatment operations into one site.</li> <li>Provides new plant adaptable to automation.</li> <li>Defers expansion of R.R. Plant.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continues remote operations.</li> <li>Improvements are required for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Dams</li> <li>Diversion pipeline</li> <li>Treatment plant @ lower site.</li> <li>Transmission main.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Requires new storage reservoir.</li> <li>Requires demolition of facilities at upper site.</li> <li>Requires additional land @ lower site.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continued remote operation</li> <li>Requirement for occasional "emergency visit"</li> <li>Fish passage.</li> <li>Land acquisition.</li> </ol>	\$15,041
<b>6 Membrane Filters 2 MGD</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continues service to all customers.</li> <li>Combines treatment operations into one site.</li> <li>Provides new plant adaptable to automation.</li> <li>Defers expansion of R.R. Plant.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continues remote operations.</li> <li>Improvements are required for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Dams</li> <li>Diversion pipeline</li> <li>Treatment plant @ lower site.</li> <li>Transmission main.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Requires new storage reservoir.</li> <li>Requires demolition of facilities @ uppr site.</li> <li>Requires additional land @ lower site.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continued remote operation</li> <li>Requirement for occasional "emergency visit"</li> <li>Fish passage.</li> <li>Land acquisition.</li> </ol>	\$16,560
<b>7 Pump from Row River 3 MGD</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continues service to all customers.</li> <li>Eliminates cost for: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Dams</li> <li>Diversion pipeline</li> <li>Treatment plant @ both sites.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Eliminates remote operations.</li> <li>Eliminates facilities at the Layng Creek sites.</li> <li>Avoids the need for an additional plant expansion.</li> <li>Reduces required units @ R.R. Plant and reduces operation costs.</li> <li>Provides a plant that is adaptable to automation.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Requires improvements to the transmission main.</li> <li>Requires new pumping facilities.</li> <li>Requires new storage reservoir.</li> <li>Requires demolition of dams and suspension bridge.</li> <li>Requires additional land @ lower site.</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>What level of demolition is required?</li> <li>Who will own abandoned sites?</li> <li>Where should new pumping facilities &amp; reservoir be constructed?</li> <li>What is cost for R.R. Plant?</li> <li>Land acquisition.</li> </ol>	\$15,638

(1) Costs in thousands, year 2000-dollar value

